

**COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION
September 23, 2021 Virtual Meeting
Minutes**

Call to Order: Dr. Monica H. Cipes, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, September 23, 2021 at 9:01 a.m. Central.

Roll Call

Commissioners present: Dr. John D. Ball; Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez; Dr. Edwin A. Del Valle Sepulveda; Dr. Gary M. DeWood; Dr. Carlotta A. Evans; Dr. David M. Kim; Daniel J. Meara; Dr. Steven E. Parker; Dr. Kumar J. Patel; Dr. Seena Patel; Dr. Raquel Rozdolski; Dr. Mitra Sadrameli; Dr. Renato M. Silva; and Ms. Carol Trecek

Ms. Karen Burgess and Dr. Arpana S. Verma were unable to attend.

In addition, Dr. Rudolph Liddell, III, Seventeenth District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended the meeting.

Commission staff present: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Ms. Kelli Cousins, coordinator.

ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, senior associate general counsel; Ms. Cathryn E. Albrecht, senior associate general counsel; Dr. Kathleen O'Loughlin, executive director

Guest of the Commission: Incoming Commissioners: Dr. Carlos D. Bertot; Dr. Jasbir D. Upadhyaya; Dr. Marc G. Nuger; and Dr. Susan K. Zelazo-Smith

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Cipes directed the Commission's attention to the CCEPR Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commissioners disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

Commission Member	Affiliation Disclosed
Dr. Gary DeWood	Employed by Spear Education
Dr. Kumar Patel	Personal friends with leadership of the Indian Dental Association
Dr. Seena Patel	Employed by A. T. Still University, Arizona School of Dentistry & Oral Health

Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Tironi gave a short presentation regarding general topics such as volunteers' fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

ADA Policy on Professional Conduct and Harassment: Ms. Albrecht gave a short presentation regarding the ADA's policies regarding professional conduct.

Approval of Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Cipes reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution

may be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

Approval of Minutes from CCEPR April 2021 Meeting and August 18, 2021 Special Meeting
CERP Provider Education and Outreach Update
Appointments to the Commission
Committee and Consultant Appointments
Future CCEPR Meeting Dates
Results of Fall 2021 CERP Applicant Survey
CERP Participation and Approval Data

Reports from Other Agencies

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: Dr. Liddell expressed the Board's gratitude for the Commission's hard work. Dr. Liddell also reported on discussions within the Seventeenth District regarding Resolution 31, submitted by the Commission for consideration by the 2021 ADA House of Delegates. Dr. Liddell stated that the Board was supportive of the Resolution to amend the composition of CCEPR as set forth in the *Governance and Organizational Manual of the American Dental Association*.

Senior Vice President Education and Professional Affairs: Dr. Ziebert reported that based on year to date financial reports, CCEPR is projected to end the year with positive revenues over expenses, due in part to the increase in the number of providers participating in the program, including those approved through Joint Accreditation. In light of this favorable financial position, the Commission's 2022 budget, which will be considered by the 2021 House of Delegates in October, includes funding for a third full time employee for the Commission. Dr. Ziebert also drew the Commission's attention to several other Resolutions before the House, including Resolutions 32, 47 and 48 which address, respectively, a proposed amendment to the ADA definition of continuing competency to better align with CODA standards, and conducting market research on the availability of CE activities addressing treatment of patients with special needs and developing CE activities to assist clinicians in meeting those needs.

ADA Executive Director: Dr. O'Loughlin updated the Commission on ADA activities in the previous six months. Dr. O'Loughlin noted that the Association continues to experience challenges related to membership recruitment and retention, with membership levels in 2021 to date lower than projected. Some of the current shortfall is attributed to ongoing fallout from the pandemic, with processing of membership applications and dues slowed in some states. Dr. O'Loughlin also emphasized the need for increasing diversity within the Association, and that it is crucial for the ADA to engage new graduates by demonstrating value to an increasingly diverse profession. Dr. O'Loughlin reported that the ADA recently established the ADA Science Research Institute (ADASRI) to better support the ADA's strategic goal of advocating for and advancing oral health. Dr. O'Loughlin also commented on Resolution 31-2021, noting that it is important for the Commission to take steps to mitigate potential conflicts of interest, which the resolution proposes to do through a modification of the method for appointing a member of the Commission. Dr. Cipes acknowledged Dr. O'Loughlin's upcoming retirement, and extended the Commission's thanks for her exceptional work on behalf of the Association and the profession.

Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors: The Commission received an informational report from Ms. Borysewicz regarding a meeting of staff members from over 20 accreditors for continuing education in the health professions held virtually on August 25, 2021. Topics discussed in the meeting included an outcomes-based continuing education model being piloted by the American Nurses Credentialing Center, a discussion of accreditors' policies and criteria regarding validating CE content, and the implementation of the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education's new Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE.

Commission Business, Administration and Governance

Planning and Assessment Committee: CCEPR Strategic Planning: Dr. Evans reported that the Planning and Assessment Committee will be meeting in the next few months to discuss the Commission's current strategic plan and to consider options for conducting the next strategic planning process. It is anticipated that this will include a survey of Commissioners and stakeholders to identify a list of priorities, a facilitated discussion to select strategic priorities and goals for the next few years, and development of a dashboard to monitor progress.

Finance Committee Report: Dr. Sadrameli presented an informational report on the Commission's finances, noting that revenues from CERP provider fees in 2021 are projected to meet budgeted levels. Additionally, revenues from Joint Accreditation are higher than budgeted. The Commission will also see a positive variance in budgeted expenses for the year; since both Commission meetings have been held virtually no travel expenses have been incurred. Dr. Sadrameli also noted that the Commission's 2022 budget, to be considered by the ADA House of Delegates in October 2021 as part of the overall ADA budget, includes a proposed increase in CERP provider fees to help offset the costs of a third full time employee to support the Commission.

Joint Accreditation Update: The Commission received an informational report on ADA CERP participation in Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education. As of September 1, 2021, 26 of the 119 providers accredited by Joint Accreditation have elected CERP recognition through this process. The Commission noted that the number of jointly accredited providers requesting ADA CERP recognition has increased in each of the two years that ADA CERP has participated in the program.

CERP Provider Education and Outreach: The Commission received an informational report (on the consent calendar) regarding communications with the communities of interest in the previous six months, including individual communications to 459 CERP recognized providers regarding their status as commercial interests and their eligibility to participate in ADA CERP after June 30, 2022, and staff presentations during the Association for Continuing Dental Education's (ACDE) annual meeting August 5-6, 2021.

Appointments to the Commission: The Commission was informed (on the consent calendar) of the appointment to the Commission of the following members to fill positions being vacated by members completing their terms: Dr. Carlos D. Bertot, appointed by the American Academy of Pediatric Dentistry; Dr. Jasbir D. Upadhyaya, appointed by the American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology; Dr. Marc Nuger and Dr. Susan K. Zelazo-Smith, both appointed by the American Dental Association. In addition, Dr. Renato M. Silva was appointed by the American Association of Endodontists to a full 4-year term, after completing the remainder of Dr. Karl Keiser's term. These Commissioners' four-year terms will begin with the close of the 2021 ADA House of Delegates.

Committee and Consultant Appointments: The Commission received as informational a list of Committee appointments for 2020-2021. The Commission also took action (on consent) on appointments of consultants to participate in the CERP application review process in 2021-2022. Appointments are for a one year term beginning with the close of the 2021 ADA House of Delegates.

Action. The Commission appoints the following consultants to participate in the CERP application review process, for a one year term beginning October 2021 through October 2022: Dr. Brian Beitel, Dr. Jeffrey Bennett, Dr. Elizabeth Bilodeau, Dr. Hardeep Chehal, Dr. Monica Cipes, Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. Gary DeWood, Dr. Joseph Fiorellini, Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick, and Dr. Eugene McGuire.

Election of 2021-2022 Officers: In accordance with the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, the Commission elected Dr. John D. Ball as chair of the Commission for

2021-2022, and Dr. Daniel J. Meara as vice-chair of the Commission for 2021-2022. The officers' terms will be effective beginning with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2021 through the close of the House of Delegates in October 2022.

Acknowledgment of Service: The Commission acknowledged the following Commissioners whose terms will expire in October 2021: Dr. Monica H. Cipes, chair, Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez, Dr. Gary M. DeWood, and Dr. Steven E. Parker.

Future Meeting Dates: The Commission received an informational report on the consent calendar listing the Commission's next meeting dates: a virtual meeting scheduled for April 28, 2022, and an in-person meeting September 29-30 in Chicago, conditions permitting.

ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures

ADA CERP Standards Revision Steering Committee: Dr. Cipes reported on steps the Committee has taken as it resumes the comprehensive revision of the ADA CERP Recognition Standards. The Committee reviewed the framework for revised Standards proposed in 2017, as well as the content areas of the accreditation criteria of several accreditors in the health professions. The Committee believed that the proposed framework is an improvement over the current CERP Standards in that it reflects the order of the CE planning process, and is consistent with the other agencies' criteria. The Committee recommended, and the Commission concurred, that the proposed framework for revised Standards could be further modified by combining two of the proposed six new Standards that relate to evaluation and assessment into a single Standard on evaluation. In discussing potential revisions to the Standards, the Commission emphasized the need to streamline the Standards to create a set of clear expectations for CE providers regarding the requirements for effective continuing education, and subsequently developing an application form which captures relevant documentation. The Commission also noted the importance of developing educational tools, such as webinars, to help providers better understand the ADA CERP requirements and their relevance to effective education.

Dr. Cipes also reminded the Commission that the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education recently revised its Standards for Commercial Support, combining those with criteria regarding the validity of CE content. The ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited Continuing Education have been adopted by five other accrediting agencies for continuing education in the health professions. In considering revisions to the ADA CERP Standards related to managing commercial conflicts of interest, the Committee suggested that the Commission may wish to review the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence.

Action. The Commission approves the following amended working list for the revised CERP Recognition Standards:

- Propose and Mission
- CE Planning
- CE Delivery
- Commercial Conflicts of Interest
- Evaluation;

and requests that a subcommittee review the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education's Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited Continuing Education and make a recommendation to the Commission as to whether these should be adopted by the Commission and incorporated into the revised CERP Recognition Standards.

CERP Eligibility Committee Report: Dr. Meara provided a summary of the Committee's activities since the Commission's August meeting. As a result of the Commission's actions at that meeting, 46 currently recognized providers were notified that the Commission has determined that they are considered commercial interests, which will make them ineligible for CERP recognition after June 30, 2023, and 411

providers were notified that they will remain eligible for continued recognition after that date. Subsequently three providers have requested a more detailed “CERP Business Structure Review” to re-assess whether they are commercial interests. The Committee is in the process of evaluating these, and is following up with nine providers from which additional information is needed, or which have not yet completed the Commercial Interest Questionnaire. After completing these reviews, the Committee will make recommendations regarding these providers’ eligibility at a future meeting of the Commission.

ADA CERP Provider Recognition

Fall 2021 Recommended Recognition Actions: The Commission considered 18 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, one request for reconsideration of a denied new application, one request for reconsideration of a provider notified of the Commission’s intent to withdraw recognition, 54 applications for continued recognition, and 12 progress reports.

Action: The Commission grants initial recognition to 17 providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 50 providers; postpones action on three applications pending submission of supplemental information; notifies two providers of intent to withdraw recognition; and withdraws recognition from four providers for failure to meet program requirements. The Commission discontinues recognition of seven providers at the request of those providers. Individual actions on all submissions are listed in Appendix 1, a confidential section of these minutes.

As a result of these actions, 502 CE providers will be ADA CERP recognized, effective November 1, 2021. This total includes 26 providers approved through Joint Accreditation.

Results of Fall 2021 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications in Fall 2021, along with comparisons from previous application cycles (on the consent calendar).

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (on the consent calendar).

Miscellaneous

Letter from American Society of Constituent Dental Executives (ASCDE): The Commission considered a letter submitted by Ms. Karen Burgess on behalf of the American Society of Constituent Dental Executives communicating concerns regarding the ADA CERP application process which the group perceives as burdensome. The Commission noted that in the next year it will be revising the CERP Standards, as well as strategic planning, and input from stakeholders would be valuable in these processes. The Commission requested that a letter be prepared in response to ASCDE, reiterating the Commission’s plan to revise the CERP Recognition Standards by reducing redundancies and focusing on criteria which support effective education, and that as part of this process, the Commission will reach out to the communities of interest, including ASCDE, with opportunities to provide input and feedback.

ADA 2021 House of Delegates Resolutions: The Commission reviewed the schedule of the House of Delegates, noting that Resolution 31, submitted by the Commission and proposing a revision to the composition of the Commission in the *ADA Governance and Organizational Manual*, would be considered during the open hearing of the Reference Committee on Dental Education, Science and Related Matters, on October 14, 2021 at 12:00 pm. Dr. Ball requested that any Commissioners present during the Reference Committee provide testimony in support of the resolution. Dr. Kumar Patel indicated that as a delegate he would also be available to speak in favor of the resolution during the House of Delegates.

Adjournment: 3:30 p.m., Thursday, September 23, 2021