

**COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION  
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION  
September 28, 2023  
Minutes**

**Call to Order:** Dr. Daniel J. Meara, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, September 28, 2023 at 9:01 a.m. Central via Zoom. The meeting was virtual.

**Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:** Dr. Carlos A. Bertot; Ms. Reva Brennan; Dr. Edwin del Valle-Sepúlveda; Dr. Carlotta A. Evans; Dr. Kecia S. Leary; Dr. Anthony R. Mecham; Dr. Marc G. Nuger; Dr. Kumar J. Patel; Dr. Seena Patel; Dr. Cynthia S. Petrie; Dr. Raquel M. Rozdolski; Dr. Arif Salman; Dr. Bruce Seidberg; Ms. Carol Trecek; Dr. Jasbir D. Upadhyaya; and Dr. Susan K. Zelazo-Smith.

Dr. Roberta Pileggi was unable to attend.

In addition, Dr. John Hisel (Eleventh District) Board of Trustees liaison, was in attendance.

**Commission staff present:** Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Ms. Kelli Cousins, manager; Mr. Christopher Smith, coordinator.

**ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting:** Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, senior associate general counsel.

**Guests of the Commission:** Incoming Commissioners Dr. Anil Ardeshta, Dr. Stanley Heleniak, and Dr. Kelly Kennedy.

**Preliminary Business**

**Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships:** The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Meara directed the Commission’s attention to the CCEPR Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. The following affiliations were disclosed during the meeting:

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Dr. Carlos A. Bertot	American Academy of Pediatric Dentistry, member; University of Kentucky College of Dentistry, alumnus
Dr. Edwin del Valle-Sepúlveda	Hispanic Dental Association, past president
Dr. Kecia S. Leary	American Academy of Pediatric Dentistry, member
Dr. Daniel J. Meara	American Cleft Palate Craniofacial Association, member
Dr. Kumar J. Patel	Georgia Indian Dental Association, founding member
Dr. Seena Patel	American Academy of Orofacial Pain, member
Dr. Cynthia S. Petrie	James Craig, DDS, professional relationship

**Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics:** Ms. Tironi gave a short presentation regarding general legal topics such as volunteers’ fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

**Approval of Consent Agenda:** A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Meara reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution

may be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

Approval of Minutes from CCEPR April 2023 Meeting, July 2023 Special Meeting  
Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors Group  
Appointments to the Commission  
Committee and Consultant Appointments  
Future CCEPR Meeting Dates  
CERP Provider Education and Outreach Update  
Results of Spring 2023 CERP Applicant Survey  
CERP Participation and Approval Data  
ADA 2023 House of Delegates Resolutions  
Social Media Posting Protocol for ADA Officers, Trustees and National Volunteers

**Approval of Minutes from CCEPR April 2023 Meeting and July 2023 Special Meeting:** The Commission received drafts of minutes from the April 2023 and July 2023 meetings of the Commission (on consent).

**Action.** The Commission approves the minutes of the April 2023 and July 2023 meetings.

### **Reports from Other Agencies**

**ADA Board of Trustees Liaison:** Dr. Hisel reported on initiatives to transform the ADA into a more nimble organization through the implementation of a strategic forecasting process. Through a year-round process of budgeting and forecasting, the ADA is positioning itself to identify and respond to member needs and to more quickly address challenges that arise. The ADA will also be considering revising its member dues structure.

**ADA Senior Vice President Education and Professional Affairs:** Dr. Ziebert highlighted activities in the ADA's Division of Education, noting that the division was in a positive financial position, with revenues running ahead of budget due in large part to increases in the number of test administrations, including the Dental Admissions Test, the Integrated National Dental Board Examination, and the Dental Hygiene National Board Exam. Dr. Ziebert also noted that there are now 73 accredited dental schools with several more in the pipeline. Dr. Ziebert also reported on progress to develop interstate licensure compacts, an initiative in which the ADA is participating with the Council of State Governments (CSG). At the time of this meeting, three states had adopted legislation supporting interstate dental licensure compacts, and several additional states are in the process. It is anticipated that seven states will have adopted this legislation in 2024, the minimum number of states required to activate the compacts.

**Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors Group:** The Commission received information (on consent) regarding a meeting of accrediting agencies for continuing education in various health professions held virtually on August 24, 2023. Items discussed included the following: education resources accreditors offer CE providers; development of a document comparing CE accreditation standards in the health professions; implications of greater use of Artificial Intelligence for continuing education providers and learners; newly enacted legislation in Florida that prohibits healthcare professionals from providing certain types of healthcare and the potential impact this may have on CE providers that offer CE to a national audience; and a proposal to draft a statement articulating the purpose and value of accredited continuing education.

## Commission Business, Administration and Governance

**Planning and Assessment Committee: CCEPR Strategic Planning:** Dr. Evans provided a status report on the Commission's strategic plan and tactics slated for 2023, noting that progress is being made on revising the ADA CERP Recognition Standards and that work on an online application platform may begin soon, Dr. Evans also noted the importance of building assessment metrics into the Commission's activities to enhance its ability to analyze effectiveness.

**Financial Report:** Dr. Kumar Patel and Ms. Borysewicz presented a summary of the Commission's finances through August 2023. The Commission's revenues are projected to exceed budget in 2023. Although the number of providers participating in the program has been reduced as a result of the change to the ADA CERP Eligibility Criteria which took effect July 1, 2023, the loss of revenue from these providers' annual fees has been offset by new application fees and fees from providers participating through Joint Accreditation. Staff reported that the ADA was negotiating a service agreement with a vendor for configuring and implementing an online accreditation platform. Once the agreement is executed work can begin on configuring the software to permit ADA CERP application and review processes to be conducted online.

**Policies and Procedures Committee Report:** Dr. del Valle-Sepúlveda presented the Committee's recommendations regarding revisions to several ADA CERP and CCEPR policies, as part of the Commission's periodic review of its policies and procedures.

The Committee recommended, and the Commission agreed with, revisions to the ADA CERP Complaints Policy in order to clarify the steps and timeline of the complaints process, and to include procedures for investigating complaints related to the validity of CE course content.

**Action.** The Commission adopts revisions to the ADA CERP Complaints Policy as indicated in Appendix 1.

The Committee recommended revisions to the ADA CERP Procedures for an Adverse Action to more clearly describe the process by which the Commission notifies a provider of its intent to proceed with an adverse action, and the provider's options for requesting the Commission to reconsider the adverse action. The Committee also recommended updates to the section describing the composition of the Appeal Board to reflect the current composition of the Commission, and the process for convening a Hearing Panel of the Appeal Board when an appeal has been received. The Commission concurred with the Committee's recommendations.

**Action.** The Commission adopts revisions to the ADA CERP Procedures for an Adverse Action Against a Continuing Education Provider as indicated in Appendix 1.

The current ADA CERP definition of "Continuing Dental Education" is an excerpt from the ADA Policy Statement on Continuing Dental Education. The Committee recommended revisions (in Appendix 1) to the ADA CERP Glossary definition to conform to revisions to the ADA Policy Statement on Continuing Dental Education approved by the ADA House of Delegates in 2022. The Committee also recommended that for purposes of reviewing and approving providers of formal continuing dental education, the Commission may wish to formulate a definition of continuing dental education specific to ADA CERP that could function to assist both CE providers and the Commission in identifying whether certain activities fall within the scope of CE, and whether a provider may be eligible for ADA CERP recognition. The Commission concurred, noting that in the process of conducting reviews, Commissioners have on occasion questioned whether some providers' educational programming should be considered as continuing dental education.

**Action.** The Commission amends the ADA CERP definition of Continuing Dental Education as indicated in Appendix 1;

And further,

The Commission requests the Policies and Procedures Committee to review the ADA CERP definition of Continuing Dental Education to determine whether additional revisions are needed, and to make recommendations for the Commission's consideration at its May 2024 meeting.

The Committee proposed that the Commission adopt a new ADA CERP policy on Content Validity to further clarify ADA CERP requirements that all courses with clinical content offered for CE credit have a sound scientific basis in order to protect the public.

**Action.** The Commission adopts the ADA CERP Policy on Content Validity as indicated in Appendix 1.

The Committee noted that to date the Commission has not been successful in filling the open position on the Commission for a public member, and that this may be due in part to the stringent requirements currently in the CCEPR Criteria for Appointment to the Commission. The Committee therefore recommended eliminating the requirement that a public member and/or their immediate family member(s) may not have had a past affiliation with organized dentistry.

**Action.** The Commission adopts revisions to the CCEPR Criteria for Appointment to the Commission as indicated in Appendix 1.

**Appeal Board Appointments:** The Commission received a report (on the consent calendar) regarding appointments to the CCEPR Appeal Board for 2023-2027. The Appeal Board provides a mechanism for CE providers to appeal adverse actions taken by the Commission. The composition of the Appeal Board is defined by the CCEPR Rules. Appointments are made by the organizations which appoint member to the Commission. At the time this report was written, two organizations had not yet submitted the names of their appointees.

#### **Appointments to CCEPR Appeal Board (2023-2027)**

<b><u>Appointing Organization</u></b>	<b><u>Appeal Board Appointee</u></b>
AAE	Dr. Denis E. Simon, III
AAO	Dr. Carla A. Evans
AAOMP	TBD
AAOMR	Dr. Mitra Sadrameli
AAOMS	Dr. Daniel J. Meara
AAP	Dr. David M. Kim
AAPD	Dr. Jade Miller
AAPHD	Dr. Susan G. Reed
ACP	Dr. Mark C. Hutten
ADA	Dr. Paul Leary
ADEA	Ms. Carol Trecek
ASCDE	TBD

**Appointments to the Commission:** The Commission was informed (on the consent calendar) of the appointment to the Commission of the following members to fill positions being vacated by members completing their terms: Dr. Nicole Quezada has been selected by the American Dental Association (ADA), Dr. Anil Ardeschna has been selected by the American Association of Orthodontists (AAO), and Dr. Steven Haas has been selected by the American Dental Education Association (ADEA). The

appointments of Drs. Kennedy and Heleniak were previously announced at the April 2023 Commission meeting. These Commissioners' four-year terms will begin with the close of the 2023 ADA House of Delegates.

Additionally, the Commission was informed that Ms. Reva Brennan has been selected by the American Society of Constituent Dental Executives (ASCDE) to complete Ms. Kathlene Gerrity's term which will expire with the close of the 2027 ADA House of Delegates.

**Committee and Consultant Appointments:** The Commission received information on Committee appointments for 2023-2024 (on consent). The Commission also appointed consultants to participate in the CERP application review process in 2023-2024. Appointments are for a one-year term beginning with the close of the 2023 ADA House of Delegates.

**Action.** The Commission appoints the following consultants to participate in the CERP application review process, for a one-year term beginning October 2023 through October 2024: Dr. John Ball, Dr. Hardeep Chehal, Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez, Dr. Debra Dixon, Dr. David Kim, Dr. Timothy Kirkpatrick, Dr. Raquel Rozdolski, Dr. Mitra Sadrameli, and Ms. Carol Trecek.

**Election of 2023-2024 Officers:** In accordance with the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, the Commission elected Dr. Kecia S. Leary as chair of the Commission for 2023-2024, and Dr. Carlos A. Bertot as vice-chair of the Commission for 2023-2024. The officers' terms will be effective beginning with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2023 through the close of the House of Delegates in October 2024.

**Acknowledgement of Service:** The Commission acknowledged the following Commissioners whose terms will expire in October 2023: Dr. Daniel Meara, chair, Dr. Edwin A. del Valle-Sepúlveda, Dr. Carla A. Evans, Dr. Raquel Rozdolski, and Ms. Carol Trecek.

**Future CCEPR Meeting Dates:** The Commission received an informational report (on consent) on the Commission's next meeting dates which are scheduled as follows: May 2, 2024, virtual meeting; September 26-27, 2024, in Chicago; April 24, 2025, virtual meeting; and September 25-26, 2025, in Chicago.

### **ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures**

**Standards Revision Steering Committee Summary Report:** Dr. Meara summarized activity to date on the comprehensive revision of the ADA CERP Recognition Standards, noting that the Standards Revisions Subcommittees had reviewed drafts of ADA CERP Standards prepared by staff following the revised framework approved by the Commission. The Steering Committee reviewed and supports the format and content of the draft Standards. and identified areas where some further discussion and revision may be needed. The Committee proposes additional work be conducted by the Subcommittees and the Steering Committee with revised drafts to be presented to the Commission for its consideration.

In its review of the revised Standards, the Committee noted that the Accreditation Council's Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited Continuing Education have been adopted by a number of other accrediting agencies, including Joint Accreditation. The Subcommittee assigned to consider revisions to ADA CERP Standard V related to managing commercial conflicts of interest noted that the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence, introduced in 2020, clearly communicate expectations for providers regarding steps needed to help ensure that CE is based on accepted science and is independent of commercial influence. The Steering Committee concurred, and recommends that rather than revising ADA CERP Standard V, the Commission consider adopting the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence as a component of the revised ADA CERP Standards, in order to provide

CERP recognized providers with clear guidance and to foster alignment with other accreditors in the health professions.

**Action.** The Commission approves the concept of adopting the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE as a requirement for ADA CERP recognition as part of the revised ADA CERP Recognition Standards.

The Commission noted that if the Commission formally adopts CERP Standards based on the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE, ADA CERP will not need a separate policy on CE Content Validity, as approved in a separate action during this meeting, since the ACCME Standards include a standard on content validity. The Commission also noted that the communities of interest will be invited to comment on drafts of the revised CERP Standards, including the Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE.

**CERP Eligibility Committee Report:** Ms. Trecek presented the Committee's findings and recommendation regarding the eligibility of a certain provider to continue to participate in ADA CERP since the revised Eligibility Criteria took effect on July 1, 2023. The Commission's discussion regarding this provider's eligibility is detailed in a confidential section of this report.

Ms. Trecek also outlined the Committee's recommendations to update the CERP Commercial Interest Questions (Appendix 2), which are included in the CERP pre-application forms used by the Commission to determine a provider's eligibility to apply for ADA CERP recognition. The revisions are intended to help ensure that more complete information is captured in the initial evaluation of a provider, as well as to offer CE providers clearer guidance regarding ADA CERP commercial interest requirements.

**Action.** The Commission approves revisions to the ADA CERP Commercial Interest Questions as shown in Appendix 2, and that the revised questions be incorporated into the ADA CERP pre-application forms.

Ms. Trecek conveyed the Committee's suggestion that the ADA CERP Business Structure Review outline should similarly be revised in order to capture information about a provider's business structure and any affiliations with commercial interests. The Commission concurred with the suggestion and requested that the Committee review and propose appropriate revisions to the ADA CERP Business Structure Review outline.

**CERP Provider Education and Outreach Update:** The Commission received an informational report (on consent) regarding communications with the communities of interest in the previous six months, including presentations at the Association of Continuing Dental Education annual meeting and a Joint Accreditation meeting, broadcast communications regarding implementation of the revised CERP Eligibility Criteria and revised toolkit for managing commercial conflicts of interest, and regularly scheduled newsletters and announcements.

### **ADA CERP Provider Recognition Actions**

**ADA CERP Fall 2023 Recommended Recognition Actions:** The Commission considered 22 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, two new applications postponed, two requests for reconsideration of intent to withdraw, one substantive change report, 52 applications for continued recognition, and 11 progress reports.

**Action:** The Commission grants initial recognition to 22 providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 49 providers; denies recognition to new applicants; postpones action on two submissions; and withdraws recognition from two providers for failure to meet program



requirements. The Commission discontinues recognition of 8 providers at the request of those providers. Individual actions on all submissions are listed in Appendix 3, a confidential section of these minutes.

As a result of these actions, 478 CE providers will be ADA CERP recognized, effective November 1, 2023. This total includes 36 providers approved through Joint Accreditation.

**Results of Fall 2023 CERP Applicant Survey:** The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications in Fall 2023, along with comparisons from previous application cycles (on the consent calendar).

**Joint Accreditation Update:** The Commission received information on ADA CERP participation in Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education. As of September 21, 2023, 36 of the 159 providers accredited by Joint Accreditation have elected CERP recognition through this process. The number of jointly accredited providers requesting ADA CERP recognition has increased in each of the three years that ADA CERP has participated in the program, with jointly accredited providers now representing 7.7% of the total number of ADA CERP nationally recognized providers.

**CERP Participation and Approval Data:** The Commission received an informational report (on consent) tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates.

#### MISCELLANEOUS

**ADA 2023 House of Delegates Resolutions:** The Commission received an informational report on Resolutions to be considered by the ADA House of Delegates in October 2023. As of the date of this meeting, no Resolutions regarding CCEPR, ADA CERP, continuing dental education or governance of the Commissions had been received.

**Social Media Posting Protocol for ADA Officers, Trustees, and National Volunteers:** The Commission received an informational report on an updated social media protocol for ADA trustees, officers and national volunteers adopted by the Board of Trustees at its July meeting.

**New Business:** None.

**Adjournment:** 2:25 p.m., Thursday, September 28, 2023