

**COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION HEADQUARTERS, CHICAGO
September 26-27, 2024
Minutes**

Call to Order: Dr. Kecia S. Leary, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, September 26, 2024 at 9:12 a.m. Central.

Roll Call

Commissioners present: Dr. Anil P. Ardeschna; Ms. Reva Brennan; Dr. Stanley J. Heleniak; Dr. Kelly S. Kennedy; Dr. Marc G. Nuger; Dr. Seena Patel; Dr. Amey G. Patil; Dr. Cynthia S. Petrie; Dr. Victor Rodriguez; Dr. Arif Salman; Dr. Bruce Seidberg; Dr. Jasbir D. Upadhyaya; and Dr. Susan K. Zelazo-Smith. In addition, Dr. Steven E. Haas, Dr. Anthony R. Mecham, Dr. Kumar J. Patel, and Dr. Roberta Pileggi participated virtually.

Dr. Carlos A. Bertot was unable to attend.

In addition, Dr. David Manzanares (First Vice President) Board of Trustees liaison, was in attendance.

Commission staff present: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Ms. Kelli Cousins, manager; Mr. Christopher Smith, coordinator.

ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, senior associate general counsel.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Leary directed the Commission’s attention to the CCEPR Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. The following affiliations were disclosed during the meeting:

Name	Affiliation
Dr. Steven E. Haas	Boston University, alumnus
Dr. Kelly S. Kennedy	Ohio Dental Association, member; Midwest Implant Institute, patient referrals
Dr. Kumar J. Patel	Georgia Indian Dental Association, founding member
Dr. Seena Patel	AT Still University Arizona, faculty; California Dental Association, lecturer
Dr. Amey G. Patil	INDEX Conferences and Exhibitions Organisation Est., lecturer; California Dental Association, lecturer
Dr. Roberta Pileggi	University of Texas at Houston Dental School, former faculty
Dr. Victor Rodriguez	University of Texas at Houston Dental School, alumnus and faculty; Greater Houston Dental Society, member
Dr. Bruce Seidberg	Boston University, alumnus; College of Diplomates of the American Board of Endodontics, member
Dr. Susan K. Zelazo-Smith	Chicago Dental Society, member

Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Tironi gave a short presentation regarding general legal topics such as volunteers' fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

Approval of Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Leary reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution may be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

- Approval of Minutes from CCEPR May 2024 Meeting
- Appointments to the Commission
- Consultant Appointments
- Future CCEPR Meeting Dates
- CERP Provider Education and Outreach
- Results of Fall 2024 CERP Applicant Survey
- CERP Participation and Approval Data

Approval of Minutes from CCEPR May 2024 Meeting: The Commission received drafts of minutes from the May 2024 meeting of the Commission (on consent).

Action. The Commission approves the minutes of the May 2024 meeting.

Reports from Other Agencies

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: Dr. Manzanares reported on the major technology conversion underway as the ADA transitions to a new association management system across the Tripartite. Dr. Manzanares also provided an update regarding the sale of the ADA headquarters building in Chicago and impending move to new headquarters offices located at 401 N. Michigan Avenue. The move is planned for the first quarter of 2025. Dr. Manzanares also reported that the Board has created a task force to explore ways to alleviate dental student loan debt.

ADA Senior Vice President Education and Professional Affairs: Dr. Ziebert reported on the Coalition for Modernizing Dental Licensure's efforts to establish interstate dental licensure compacts. As of July 2024, ten states had adopted legislation supporting interstate dental licensure compacts, meeting the minimum requirement for the compacts to become active. Dr. Ziebert reported that similar legislation is being considered in several other states. The compacts are designed to increase portability of dental licensure. A new commission to govern the dental licensure compacts is being established by the participating states, and is anticipated to meet in January 2025 to establish rules and data management systems. In other matters related to the Center of Excellence for Education and Training, formerly the Division of Education, Dr. Ziebert noted that the Center's budget is looking healthy and is projected to meet targets. Dr. Ziebert also announced that the ADA was seeking applicants for the new position of Vice President for the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

Commission Business, Administration and Governance

Planning and Assessment Committee: Strategic Plan Update: Dr. Nuger provided a status report on the Commission's strategic plan and tactics slated for 2025, noting that the ADA CERP Recognition Standards revisions were sent out for public comment and that work on an online application platform has begun with testing and data migration most likely to occur in 2025. Ongoing collaboration with Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education continues to bring new CE providers into ADA CERP, and has helped offset the loss of providers that are commercial interests, which are no longer eligible for ADA CERP recognition. Dr. Nuger also noted that CCEPR has contracted with a communications firm to assist in developing and deploying messaging in the fourth quarter of 2024 regarding the function and value of ADA CERP recognition.

Financial Update: Dr. Kumar Patel presented a summary of the Commission's finances through August 2024 which indicated that the Commission was on track to meet budgeted revenues, with 95% of all CERP provider annual fees collected to date (CCEPR August 2024 Financial Report attached as Appendix 1). However, the Commission is projected to end the year with a deficit of \$94,005. A portion of this projected shortfall is the result of an increase in the line item for staff salaries and benefits due to a new process for allocating staff support for ADA programs. The Commission was informed by staff that to support strategic forecasting recent financial reports now include additional overhead allocations. The Commission noted that over the last five years, CCEPR has made successful efforts to balance its revenues and expenses.

Appointments to the Commission: The Commission was informed (on the consent calendar) of the appointment to the Commission of the following members to fill positions being vacated by members completing their terms: Dr. Andrew McDonald has been appointed by the American Dental Association (ADA), Dr. Megan Cloidt has been selected by the American Association of Public Health Dentistry (AAPHD), and Dr. Julie Robinson-Smith has been selected by the American Academy of Oral Medicine (AAOM). These Commissioners' four-year terms will begin with the close of the 2024 ADA House of Delegates.

Election of 2024-2025 Officers: In accordance with the Rules of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition, the Commission elected Dr. Marc G. Nuger as chair of the Commission for 2024-2025, and Dr. Jasbir Upadhyaya as vice-chair of the Commission for 2024-2025. The officers' terms will be effective beginning with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2024 through the close of the House of Delegates in October 2025.

Acknowledgement of Service: The Commission acknowledged the following Commissioners whose terms will expire in October 2024: Dr. Kecia Leary, chair, Dr. Kumar Patel, and Dr. Seena Patel.

Future CCEPR Meeting Dates: The Commission received an informational report (on consent) on the Commission's next meeting dates which are scheduled as follows: April 24, 2025, virtual meeting; September 25-26, 2025, in Chicago; April 23, 2026, virtual meeting; and September 24-25, 2026, in Chicago.

ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures

Standards Revision Steering Committee Summary Report: Dr. Leary summarized activity to date on the comprehensive revision of the ADA CERP Recognition Standards, noting that in June 2024 a broadcast email was sent to all ADA CERP recognized providers, state dental boards and state dental associations announcing information about the proposed comprehensive revision to the ADA CERP Recognition Standards and Policies and inviting the communities of interest to submit comments. The Steering Committee reviewed the feedback collected through the Call for Comments online survey, as well as letters emailed separately from the executive directors of five associations, including four state dental societies. The Committee noted several themes in the feedback submitted: support for efforts to streamline the CERP Standards; the need for clear information regarding expectations for providers under the revised CERP Standards; questions and concerns regarding the ACCME Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE which have been proposed for adoption with the revised CERP Standards; and concerns that ADA CERP recognition may become too difficult for some continuing dental education providers to maintain.

Based on its review of this information, the Committee proposed several additional revisions to the Standards to provide greater clarity (Appendix 2). The Committee believed that the feedback underscores the importance of the Commission's efforts to streamline and simplify the Standards and application process. The Committee also emphasized the need to develop a robust training and education program

for providers regarding the revised Standards and resources for providers regarding how to meet the new requirements.

In light of the Committee's recommendations, the Commission considered a timeline for implementation. The Commission noted that providers would need sufficient time to make any needed adjustments to bring their programs into compliance with the revised ADA CERP Recognition Standards, and the Commission will need to develop a new application and review process corresponding to the revised CERP Standards. The Commission also noted that once the revised ADA CERP Standards take effect the ADA CERP policy on Content Validity will need to be rescinded. This is because the Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE, which were developed by ACCME, and which were proposed by the Commission as part of the revised ADA CERP Standards, contain a comparable Standard on content validity. As a result of its discussions, the Commission took the following actions.

Action. The Commission adopts the revised ADA CERP Recognition Standards, including the Standards for Integrity and Independence in Accredited CE, and Policies on Periodic Review of Self-Study Activities, Calculating Credits, Awarding Credit, and Record Keeping, as shown in Appendix 2 effective June 1, 2026. And further,

The Commission rescinds the ADA CERP Policy on Content Validity effective June 1, 2026.

CERP Provider Education and Outreach Update: The Commission received an informational report prepared by staff (on consent) summarizing communications with the communities of interest in 2024. This includes a presentation at the Association of Continuing Dental Education annual meeting in August, a webinar for CERP recognized providers planned for November, ADA CERP provider newsletters and broadcast email announcements. To help increase awareness of the purpose and value of ADA CERP, the Commission has contracted with L.C. Williams Associates, a public relations and communications consultant, to assist in developing a broader communications plan, including press releases and news articles.

ADA CERP Provider Recognition Actions

CERP Complaints Committee Report: The Commission considered a report and recommendation from the Complaints Committee regarding a request for reconsideration submitted by a provider previously notified of the Commission's intent to withdraw recognition resulting from the Committee's investigation of a complaint against the provider. A summary of the Commission's discussion is included in a confidential section of these minutes.

ADA CERP Fall 2024 Recommended Recognition Actions: The Commission considered 13 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, one new application postponed, two substantive change reports, 57 applications for continued recognition, 10 progress reports, two EAP supplements, and one pre-application from an international provider.

Action: The Commission grants initial recognition to 9 providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 57 providers; denies recognition to one new applicant; postpones action on two new applications; and withdraws recognition from two providers for failure to meet program requirements. The Commission discontinues recognition of seven providers at the request of those providers. Individual recognition actions are listed in Appendix 3, a confidential section of these minutes.

As a result of these actions, 487 CE providers will be ADA CERP recognized, effective November 1, 2024. This total includes 45 providers approved through Joint Accreditation.

Results of Fall 2024 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report prepared by staff summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications in Fall 2024, along with comparisons from previous application cycles (on the consent calendar).

Joint Accreditation Update: The Commission received an informational report from staff on ADA CERP participation in Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education. As of August 15, 2024, 45 of the 174 providers accredited by Joint Accreditation have elected CERP recognition through this process. The number of jointly accredited providers requesting ADA CERP recognition has increased year over year since 2020 when ADA CERP joined the program as an Associate Member. Jointly accredited providers now represent 9.2% of the total number of ADA CERP nationally recognized providers.

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report prepared by staff (on consent) tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates.

MISCELLANEOUS

ADA 2024 House of Delegates Resolutions: The Commission received an informational report prepared by staff regarding resolutions submitted to the 2024 House of Delegates. In particular, the Commission reviewed Resolution 410. Improving Continuing Education Recognition. The Resolution asked that the ADA urge the Commission to accommodate state dental associations and other stakeholders participating in ADA CERP with more flexible rules, and less frequent and less comprehensive reporting requirements. The Resolution also recommended that the ADA establish an advisory group of staff from state and local societies to report its findings to the ADA Board of Trustees regarding ADA CERP's responsiveness to these recommendations. Dr. Manzanares and Ms. Brennan reported that the perception among many of the state dental societies is that ADA CERP recognition is burdensome to maintain and expensive for some.

The Commission discussed options for meeting with stakeholders to hear their concerns, such as convening a summit meeting of stakeholders, or holding annual meetings open to all CERP recognized providers. The Commission noted the importance of improving communications regarding ADA CERP efforts to streamline the ADA CERP Standards and application processes, and of underscoring the value of integrity and independence in CE and participating in a program that upholds those standards. As a result of its discussion, the Commission took the following action.

Action. The Commission requests staff to develop a proposal for convening a future meeting of ADA CERP stakeholders for the purpose of fostering open communications regarding the program.

The Commission also noted that Res. 410 contained background information that was incomplete or erroneous, and that the recommendation to establish a new agency to oversee the Commission was duplicative and potentially harmful to the Commission's ability to conduct its work with appropriate independence.

As a result of its discussion, the Commission determined to provide testimony in opposition to Resolution 410 during the appropriate Reference Committee Open Hearing and the House of Delegates.

Action. The Commission requests staff to develop talking points addressing the assertions and recommendations in Res. 410 and to circulate these to the Commission so that Commissioners may share with their district caucuses. And be it further,

The Commission requests those members who will be attending SmileCon to attend the Reference Committee C Open Hearing and provide testimony in opposition to Res. 410.

Revising the CERP Application Process: The Commission conducted a working session in which Commissioners were assigned to small groups focusing on each of the updated CERP Standards. For each of the criteria, the workgroups were asked to identify ways that providers could demonstrate compliance with the requirement. The work groups' findings were discussed by the Commission; notes from the session will be considered by the subcommittee(s) that will be assigned to develop new application processes for the updated CERP Standards.

New Business: None.

Adjournment: 11:46 a.m., Friday, September 27, 2024