

**COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER RECOGNITION
AMERICAN DENTAL ASSOCIATION
Virtual Meeting
April 23, 2020**

Call to Order: Dr. Susan G. Reed, chair, called a regular meeting of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition (CCEPR) to order on Thursday, April 23, 2020 at 9:00 a.m.

Roll Call

Commissioners present: Dr. John D. Ball, Ms. Karen Burgess, Dr. Monica H. Cipes, Dr. Gary M. DeWood, Dr. Edwin Del Valle Sepulveda, Dr. Carlotta A. Evans, Dr. David M. Kim, Dr. Daniel Joseph Meara, Dr. Steven E. Parker, Dr. Marcus K. Randall, Dr. Mitra Sadrameli, Dr. Mina Saraghi, Dr. Renato Silva, Ms. Carol Trecek, and Dr. Arpana Verma.

Dr. Maria Cuevas-Nunez was unable to attend.

In addition, Dr. Paul Leary, Second District Trustee, Board of Trustees liaison, attended the meeting.

Commission staff present: Ms. Mary Borysewicz, director; Ms. Kelli Cousins, coordinator.

ADA staff present for all or portions of the meeting: Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs; Ms. Paula Tironi, Esq., senior associate general counsel.

Guest of the Commission: Dr. Graham McMahon, president and CEO, Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda and Disclosure of Relationships: The Commission approved the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Dr. Reed directed the Commission's attention to the ADA Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commissioners disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

Commission Member	Affiliation Disclosed
Dr. Gary Wood	Adjunct faculty, AT Still University

Fiduciary Duty and Other Legal Topics: Ms. Tironi gave a short presentation regarding topics such as volunteers' fiduciary duty and conflicts of interest.

Consent Agenda: A consent calendar was prepared to expedite the business of the Commission. Dr. Reed reminded Commission members that any report, recommendation or resolution may be removed from the consent calendar for discussion. The following reports were accepted by the Commission on consent.

- Approval of CCEPR Meeting Minutes: October 2019 and December 2019
- Update on Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors Group
- CERP Provider Education and Outreach Update
- Committee Appointments
- Appointments to the Commission
- Appeal Board Appointments

Future CCEPR Meeting Dates
CERP Standards Revision
CERP Extended Approval Process (EAP)
Results of Spring 2020 CERP Applicant Survey
CERP Participation and Approval Data

Reports from Other Agencies

ADA Board of Trustees Liaison: Dr. Leary reported on the ADA's priorities and initiatives in response to the COVID-19 pandemic, including the development and distribution of information and resources about the virus for dental practitioners, and coordinating efforts with legislators to develop guidelines and recovery plans for opening dental practices safely. Dr. Leary thanked the Commission for its ongoing work and service to the profession under the unprecedented circumstances created by the pandemic.

Senior Vice President Education and Professional Affairs: Dr. Ziebert reported on efforts being undertaken by the ADA's Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) to support dental education programs interrupted by the pandemic in order to help students graduate in a timely manner. Dr. Ziebert also noted that the Joint Commission on National Dental Examinations (JCNDE) has accelerated its development of the Dental Licensure Objective Structured Clinical Exam (DLOSCE), with the launch of the new exam scheduled in June. Several states have expressed interest in the DLOSCE as a potential new pathway to licensure through a standardized exam that does not require patients.

Dr. Ziebert also informed the Commission that as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic and associated business disruptions, the ADA will reforecast its 2020 budget later in the year.

Meeting of U.S. Health Professions CE Accreditors Group: The Commission received a report (on consent) regarding staff participation in a meeting of the accreditors for continuing education in the health professions held in conjunction with the Alliance for Continuing Education in the Health Professions in San Francisco in January 2020. The accreditors discussed their approaches to revising accreditation criteria and identified several common themes, including alignment with Joint Accreditation criteria, a focus on core educational principles, with adaptations unique to each profession, and a shift of emphasis from policies and procedures to quality measures in professional development.

Commission Business, Administration and Governance

Composition of the Commission: The *Rules* of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition which set forth the composition of the Commission state that the Board of Commissioners shall include a member appointed by the sponsoring organization of each of the currently recognized dental specialties. With the March 2020 approval by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards (NCRDSCB) of oral medicine and orofacial pain as recognized dental specialties, the Commission took action to revise the CCEPR *Rules* accordingly.

Action: The Commission approves amending the composition of the Commission to include one member each appointed by the American Academy of Oral Medicine and the American Academy of Orofacial Pain, and that the *Rules* of the Commission for Continuing Education Provider Recognition be revised as indicated below (addition underlined).

RULES OF THE COMMISSION FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION PROVIDER
RECOGNITION (*excerpt*)

Article II. BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

Section 2. COMPOSITION: The Board of Commissioners shall consist of:

Four (4) members who shall be appointed by the Board of Trustees from the names of active, life or retired members of this Association. None of the appointees shall be a faculty member of any dental education program working more than one day per week or a member of a state board of dental examiners or jurisdictional dental licensing agency. At least two (2) of members appointed shall be general dentists.

One (1) member who is an active member of the American Association of Dental Boards and also, if eligible, an active, life or retired member of this Association shall be selected by the American Association of Dental Boards.

One (1) member who is an active member of the American Dental Education Association and also, if eligible, an active, life or retired member of this Association shall be selected by the American Dental Education Association.

The remaining Commissioners shall be selected as follows: one (1) dentist who is board certified in the respective discipline-specific area of practice and is selected by each of the following organizations: American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology, American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology, American Academy of Oral Medicine, American Academy of Orofacial Pain, American Academy of Pediatric Dentistry, American Academy of Periodontology, American Association of Endodontists, American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons, American Association of Orthodontists, American Association of Public Health Dentistry, American College of Prosthodontists; the American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists; one (1) member appointed by the American Society of Constituent Dental Executives and one (1) member of the public who is neither a dentist nor an allied dental personnel nor teaching in a dental or allied dental education institution and who is selected by the Commission, based on established and publicized criteria. In the event a Commission member sponsoring organization fails to select a Commissioner, it shall be the responsibility of the Commission to select an appropriate representative to serve as a Commissioner. The Director of the Commission shall be an ex-officio member of the Board without the right to vote.

Policies and Procedures Committee Report: Dr. Randall presented the Committee's report and recommendations for establishing formal policies and procedures regarding CCEPR operations, conforming with and supporting the revised CCEPR *Rules* adopted by the Commission in October 2019. As a result of its review of the proposed *CCEPR Policies and Procedures* presented by the Committee, the Commission took the following action.

Action: The Commission adopts the *CCEPR Policies and Procedures* set forth in Appendix 1.

Finance Committee Report: Dr. DeWood presented the Finance Committee's report, including year to date revenues and expenses, noting the unbudgeted revenues and expenses related to the Commission's participation in Joint Accreditation beginning in 2020. In light of this, the Committee recommended submitting a revised 2021 budget, including updated revenue and expenses projections related to Joint Accreditation.

Action: The Commission approves forwarding the revised 2021 preliminary budget shown in Appendix 2 to the ADA's Budget and Finance Committee for incorporation into the ADA's 2021 budget.

The Committee also presented a draft "Intercompany Memorandum of Understanding and Services Agreement" between the ADA and CCEPR, formalizing the terms of the services provided by the ADA to

the Commission in support of its operations. Similar agreements are being established between ADA and each of the four Commissions, permitting them to account for indirect costs in their respective annual budgets in addition to direct expenses. Based on its consideration of the proposed service agreement, the Commission took action to approve the agreement and submit it to the ADA Board of Trustees.

Action: The Commission approves submitting the Intercompany Memorandum of Understanding and Services Agreement (Appendix 3) to the ADA Board of Trustees.

The Committee noted that the shared services agreement (Appendix 3) includes a stipulation that the ADA will support the development of a web-based CERP application and review platform. Although funding for the first phase of this project, building the database architecture in Aptify, is funded through 2020 by the ADA's IT department budget, funding for the second phase, building the web-based portal that will support online submission and review of CERP applications, has not been allocated. To help ensure funding for this phase of the project in a timely fashion, the Committee recommended that the Commission submit a letter to the ADA Board of Trustees requesting allocation of funding for this project.

Action: The Commission approves submission of a written request to the ADA Board of Trustees urging the allocation of funding to complete the CERP online application tool in Aptify, consistent with the shared services agreement (Appendix 3).

Joint Accreditation Update: Dr. Monica Cipes provided an update on activity related to Joint Accreditation for Interprofessional Continuing Education subsequent to the Commission signing on as an associate accreditor beginning in 2020. As of March 30, 2020, eight of the 102 providers approved through Joint Accreditation have elected CERP recognition as an additional accreditation, including six providers new to ADA CERP. This represents a net increase in the number of CERP recognized providers and a net revenue gain to CCEPR of \$3,600. The Commission affirmed that providing opportunities for interprofessional education through Joint Accreditation will help dentists obtain continuing education in an interprofessional setting, support collaborative practice and the integration of oral and other healthcare.

CERP Provider Education and Outreach: The Commission received an update (on the consent calendar) on past and future educational presentations for CE providers, including a workshop planned for the ADA 2020 annual meeting.

Committee Appointments: The Committee received an informational report of committee assignments for 2020 (on the consent calendar).

Appointments to the Commission: The Commission was informed (on the consent calendar) that the American Association of Endodontists appointed Dr. Renato M. Silva to fill a vacancy on the Board of Commissioners created by the resignation of Dr. Karl Keiser. Dr. Silva will serve the remainder of Dr. Keiser's term, which will end with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2021.

In addition, the American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists, the sponsoring organization of the newly recognized specialty of dental anesthesiology, appointed Dr. Mana Saraghi for a 4-year term which will end with the close of the ADA House of Delegates in October 2023.

Appeal Board Appointments: The Commission received an updated report (on the consent calendar) regarding appointments to the CCEPR Appeal Board for 2019-2023. The report noted that the American Association of Dental Boards has appointed Dr. Eva Ackley to serve on the CCEPR Appeal Board.

Future Meeting Dates: The Commission received an informational report listing the Commission's next meeting dates, scheduled for October 1-2, 2020, April 22-23, 2021, and September 23-24, 2021 (on the consent calendar).

ADA CERP Standards, Policies and Procedures

Standards Revision: The Commission received a report (on the consent calendar) regarding the process to revise the CERP Recognition Standards. The process was deferred pending revision and implementation of the CERP Eligibility Criteria, and will resume later this year

CERP Eligibility Committee Report: Dr .Cipes summarized the Committee's discussions and its proposed framework for implementing the revised CERP Eligibility Criteria approved by the Commission in April 2019. To help determine which providers are commercial interests, and will no longer be eligible for CERP recognition when the revised Eligibility Criteria go into effect on July 1, 2023, the Committee made several recommendations the Commission. As a result of its considerations, the Commission took action on the recommendations as described below.

Based on the July 1, 2023 date for enforcement of the revised CERP Eligibility Criteria, and the need to identify the providers that are CERP-defined commercial interests that will no longer be eligible to participate in ADA CERP, and communicate this information to providers in a timely fashion, the Committee proposed, and the Commission supported, a time line including these key dates:

- All new applicants for CERP recognition will be required to complete a pre-application form to determine eligibility to proceed with the application process, beginning in June 2020.
- An eligibility questionnaire will be sent to all currently approved providers in late 2020 for the Commission's review in April 2021, and feedback regarding continued eligibility communicated to providers in 2021.
- All currently approved CERP providers that are determined to be commercial interests may maintain their recognition status through the normal application process, however recognition for any approved commercial interests will terminate on July 1, 2023.
- Fall 2022 will be the last application cycle in which a new provider that is a commercial interest may submit an application for initial recognition.

Action: The Commission approves the time line for implementation of the revised CERP Eligibility Criteria as outlined in Appendix 4.

Action: The Commission approves the "CERP Pre-Application for ADA CERP Recognition: Determination of Eligibility" form (hereinafter referred to as the Pre-Application Eligibility Form shown in Appendix 5) as a pre-requisite for all providers wishing to apply for CERP recognition beginning with the Spring 2021 application cycle,

And further,

The Commission establishes a fee of \$100 for providers submitting a Pre-application Eligibility Form.

In order to expedite the processing of Pre-application Eligibility Forms and minimize the potential for an increased workload for Commissioners, the Committee recommended, and the Commission approved the following.

Action: The Commission requests staff to review Pre-application Eligibility Forms as they are submitted and make a determination of the provider's eligibility to apply, except in cases where a provider has a sister company that is a commercial interest, the provider is a consultant for a commercial interest, or some other information supplied by the provider in the Pre-application

Eligibility Form creates uncertainty about the provider's eligibility, in which case staff will provide the Pre-application Eligibility Form to the CERP Eligibility Committee to review the Pre-application Eligibility Form and make a determination regarding the provider's eligibility to apply for CERP recognition,

And further,

The Commission requests that staff provide the Commission with informational reports on Pre-application Eligibility Forms submitted and their status at the Commission's regularly scheduled meetings.

To identify the currently recognized providers that are CERP-defined commercial interests that may no longer be eligible to participate in ADA CERP, the Committee recommended and the Commission approved the following.

Action: The Commission approves the proposed CERP Eligibility Survey for deployment to currently recognized providers (Appendix 6).

Action: The Commission requests staff to prepare a summary report of responses to the CERP Eligibility Survey to the CERP Eligibility Committee for review in March 2021, and that the Committee make recommendations to the Commission at its April 2021 meeting regarding providers' eligibility.

In the event that a provider requests a more in-depth review of its business structure in order to determine whether it qualifies as a commercial interest, the Committee and the Commission approved the following.

Action: The Commission directs that the CERP Eligibility Committee develop an optional CERP "Business Structure Review Process" by May 31, 2020 for the Commission's approval, by which a provider may request the Commission to conduct a review of its business structure in order to determine eligibility.

ADA CERP Provider Recognition

Extended Approval Process (EAP): The Commission received an update (on the consent calendar) regarding participation in the ADA CERP Extended Approval Process. For the May 2020–June 2021 approval period, fifteen ADA CERP approved providers (including four specialty societies and 11 ADA constituent societies) report that they will be extending approval to a total of 95 component societies. The list of EAP approved providers is published on the Commission's website.

Spring 2020 Recommended Recognition Actions: The Commission considered 12 new applications for ADA CERP recognition, 56 applications for continued recognition, and 24 progress reports.

Action: The Commission granted initial recognition to 10 providers of continuing dental education, and continued recognition to 55 providers. The Commission issued one notice of intent to withdraw recognition. The Commission discontinued recognition of six providers at the request of the providers. Individual actions on all submissions are listed in Appendix 7, a confidential section of these minutes.

Including the Commission's April 2020 actions on recognition, 477 CE providers are currently ADA CERP recognized. This total includes 8 providers approved through Joint Accreditation.

Results of Spring 2020 CERP Applicant Survey: The Commission received an informational report summarizing survey results from providers submitting applications in Spring 2020, along with results from previous application cycles (on the consent calendar).

CERP Participation and Approval Data: The Commission received an informational report tracking annual data on program participation, submission types and acceptance rates (on the consent calendar).

Miscellaneous

Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education Update: Dr. McMahon provided an overview of recent activities of the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (ACCME), noting that the agency's mission is to promote and reflect evolution in continuing medication education (CME). The ACCME accreditation criteria emphasize systems improvement, and set standards for metrics of evaluation. The agency's Standards for Commercial Support and content validity standards are designed to promote safe, effective health care, in order to support clinicians, improvements in healthcare, and to earn and maintain the public trust. The ACCME's strategic plan seeks to position the ACCME as relevant to both healthcare professionals and CE providers by promoting more effective CE, advocating for CME scholarship, evolving its standards and processes, and being responsive to public and professional needs.

New Business: The Commission considered options for supporting providers' ongoing participation in ADA CERP in light of potential business disruptions to providers' CE programs as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. In particular, the Commission was concerned that a sizeable number of providers due to submit applications in the Fall 2020 application cycle would be unable to meet the June 26, 2020 deadline; granting extensions to those providers could potentially lead to a significant increase in the number of applications submitted in later cycles. As a result of its discussion, the Commission determined to extend all current CERP providers' recognition terms an additional six months, thereby preserving the balance of applications to be reviewed in future cycles, and giving providers additional time to make adjustments to their programs in response to the pandemic.

Action: The Commission grants all currently recognized providers a 6-month extension on their recognition terms, subject to eligibility, and extends all providers' next submissions by six months.

Adjournment: 2:36 p.m., Thursday, April 23, 2020.